



Plymouth Historic Distric Commission
Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, July 17, 2019 - 7:00p.m.
Plymouth City Hall Commission Chambers

City of Plymouth
201 S. Main
Plymouth, Michigan 48170-1637

www.plymouthmi.gov
Phone 734-453-1234
Fax 734-455-1892

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Polin called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

PRESENT: Jeremy Borys, Stan Cole, Linda Filipczak, Linda May, and Colleen Polin

ABESENT: Joshua Mrozowski and John Townsend

Also present was Community Development Director, John Buzuvis and City Commission Liaison, Suzi Deal.

2. CITIZEN COMMENTS

Janet Dersey, 1181 Dewey, spoke about the future of Kellogg Park. Ms. Dersey spoke about a former plan from 2016 that citizens voted down and stated most people love Kellogg park the way it is and do not want the park changed. She has learned once changed you can't go back and fears this may happen to Kellogg Park. She would like Kellogg Park looked at as a rare antique that we are very lucky to have. Ms. Dersy stated we need to look at whatever we do to Kellogg Park thru the lens of preserving it.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES

a) A motion was made by Comm. Borys and seconded by Comm. Filipczak to approve the meeting minutes from June 5, 2019 as amended.

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

4. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

A motion was made by Comm. Filipczak and seconded by Comm. Cole to approve the agenda as presented.

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

5. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Chair Polin would like to know if a permit was pulled for work being done on the front porch at 249 S. Main Street and asked for a follow-up.

6. OLD BUSINESS

H19-04: Door & siding replacement & front porch renovation for 284 S. Union Street. (Revised)

Ellen Elliott had searched historical archives and provided computer pictures of the home located at 284 S. Union she found from the year 1942 to the board members, she also sent copies to Mr. Buzuvis via email.

Bill Richardson, Richland Construction contractor, and Mike Salt, architect, explained they have revised drawings removing the stone on the columns located on the front porch. Mr. Richardson explained the columns will be square at the base and rounded near the top like the images portray. The siding was also revised removing the window trim that was not previously there.

Mr. Salt spoke about the doorways and described the custom-made doors made to replace the deteriorated doors for both entranceways.

Mr. Richardson described the “Dutch lap” siding replacing the “double4” siding, he provided samples of the siding and the color to the board. The porch & side lighting fixtures will remain.

Board Discussion

Comm. Borys asked about the columns and Mr. Salt described the reasons for the column’s placement and base size.

Comm. Cole asked about salvaging the front door and Mr. Richardson explained the reasons why it cannot be saved, and the window being not tempered also. Comm. Cole explained the double 4 siding will need to be replaced with double 4 siding. The soffit on the porch will be replaced. The vertical panels below the porch and the block at the bottom of the home will be re-painted with the same white color. The decking and steps will be re-painted to a grey color. They will not be adding any trim, keeping it as it is, or they will match it back to the way it was.

Chair Polin asked the applicant if they have discovered any stucco on the block and Mr. Richardson explained he did not. Chair Polin explained if they find any discoveries they may want to change, it would be up to them, but they would need to return to the Historic District board with their sound evidence.

Comm. Cole spoke about the details revealed of the open rail porch from the photos provided by Ellen Elliott.

A motion was made by Comm. Cole, supported by Comm. Filipczak, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of H19-04, 284 S. Union, Door & siding replacement & front porch renovation, providing the following conditions are met:

1. The construction and replacement be of period appropriate for the railing system and columns.
2. No windows will be replaced.
3. The siding and trim match existing exactly. Dutch lap siding is not permitted.
4. No window trim will be added.
5. The exterior porch and wall lights to remain.
6. The foundation block and vertical panels below the porch to be painted white.
7. The steps and wood decking to be painted or stained gray.

Approval is based on the finding of facts from the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation numbers 1, 2, 3, 4, 5,6 and 7 and Section 18-654 Ordinance numbers 1, 2, 3 and 4.

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY 5-0.

6. NEW BUSINESS

a) Saxton’s Site Project Update and Discussion- F5 Management (DISCUSSION ONLY- NO ACTION REQUESTED/REQUIRED)

Chair Polin explained a possible conflict of interest, she asked to recuse herself from this discussion.

A motion was made by Comm. Borys, supported by Comm. May, to allow Chair Polin to be recused.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Alex Bogaerts & Mark Abanatha, Alexander V. Bogaerts & Associates Architects, made a presentation of the proposed new structure, parking and the existing building remodel. The applicant explained his architecture firm is on the state registry of historic architects.

Mark Abanatha presented his power point presentation and went over their three objectives:

1. Restoration of the Saxton’s /Jewell Building.
2. Creating a vibrant, neighborly and aesthetically pleasing development on Maple Street.
3. Adding additional parking for the City of Plymouth.

The applicant went over the existing additions to the Saxton building from the year 1960 and another in

1965. He showed photos of the proposed Saxton's/Jewell building restoration, taking it back to its original building removing the two additions in the 60's. The roof will be replaced, re-glazing the building, removing some brick, replacing the windows in the same openings and adding some sunscreens & canopies are proposed.

The Deer and Maple Street side will have 10 (ten) 2-story brownstone style townhomes. Mr. Abanatha described the double fronted building relating to both the downtown and the fronts of homes on the south side of Maple Street. The applicant proposes to demolish the homes at 686 Maple & 674 Maple and when a partial demo of the Saxton's building is complete, expanding the public parking in that area, landscaping improvements will be done as well as expanding the Historic District boundary are proposed.

Citizen Comments

Bill Lincoln, 606 Maple, explained he lives adjacent to the new development and will be affected by it. Mr. Lincoln is in favor of the proposed development but was also mindful of the dilapidated buildings and lot that existed for many years, he asked that the Community be open minded and not shoot the project down, due to the give and take compromises of the project.

Wendy Harless, Plymouth Preservation Network, spoke about losing two contributing homes. She was in favor of the Saxton/Jewell renovations but was not in favor of the new brownstone townhomes within the historic district when they did not previously exist. She felt the 60's additions were hodge-podge and could be removed but would like the arches used as some sort of carport possibly. Ms. Harless spoke about State legislature PA169, changing historic boundaries; that will need to be processed through the State, not through this board.

Kevin Roose, 619 Maple. He spoke about the existing disrepair of the properties now are bad to look and is in favor of the buildings being removed. He would like some sort of closure for Maple Street that would prevent cars parking on it. He is in favor of the project and the parking it will provide. He is happy about the restoration of Jewell/Blaich building and compared it to the renovation of the Plymouth post office.

Tim Tingstad, 592 Maple, spoke about his first choice being a dog park or Community garden, maintaining the greenspace. His second choice would be to maintain the two homes and build the brownstones in-between. Mr. Tingstad spoke about the previous proposed developers that came before the Downtown Development and their outcome at their meetings. He felt this new development has no driveways on Maple Street and is about as good as it can be, so he is in support of this project.

Debbie Neubecker, 647 Maple, spoke about meeting the developer and appreciates his efforts to match up something that will be aesthetically appealing to the residential area. She would like the two dilapidated homes to come down she has had to look at them every day for years. Ms. Neubecker stated the entire neighborhood feels this will be a better look then what we have now.

Ellen Elliott, 404 Irvin, spoke about Mike Ferrantino, who was instrumental in saving the Penn Theatre. She felt it is a difficult project, but Mike has an appreciation of history and will be open to dialogue from the City and Community to make the project work.

Mike Ferrantino, developer of this project, spoke about his past developments such as the Penn Theatre and Starkweather Lofts. He spoke about the restoration of the Jewell building and their goal of 90 parking spots. The applicant explained the ingress and egress and repurposing the wavy building would impact the total increase to the number of parking spaces to be developed.

Board Discussion

Comm. Cole asked how many available current parking spots there and Mr. Ferrantino are answered there are approximately 50 spots. Comm. Cole stated so the net gain makes it about 34 new parking spots. Mr Ferrantino explained the Jewell building will park behind with about 6 to 8 parking spots and the townhomes will park underneath each unit. Comm. Cole stated 3 historic structures will be taken down to gain roughly 26 parking spots.

Comm. Cole read from the Secretary of Interior standards and stated, that in his opinion, the proposal does not comply in the following ways

1. Tearing down a post mid-century building is changing the spatial relationships.
2. Tearing down the two house there are only 4 or five houses within the historic district, losing two will be a challenge.
3. Replacing windows on the Jewell building is not preserving.
4. Definition of the edge of the proposed development on Ann Arbor Trail/Maple is challenging as it pertains to existing spatial relationships

NO ACTION TAKEN-DISCUSSION ONLY

A motion was made by Comm. Borys, supported by Comm. Filipczak, to allow Chair Polin to rejoin the meeting. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY 5-0.

8. REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE

Tony Bruscato, DDA, discussed the Plymouth Arts Council would like to display art from the DIA. The Art would be murals on buildings or sculptures possibly near the Wilcox home or on Ann Arbor Trail or near the parking deck or at Kellogg Park.

Mr. Bruscato also spoke about contracting Wade/Trim Engineers to develop a Master Plan for Kellogg Park. He invited anyone who might be interested to attend the DDA Board meetings which are scheduled the second Monday of each month.

Chair Polin read a letter addressed to the owners of Westborn Market regarding the renovation of the market. The Carlo Lopez mural was their reason for their visit from Ashville, North Carolina. The letter commended the marvelous repurposing of a historic property. Chair Polin thanked the owners for their work on the former post office currently renovated into the Westborn Market.

9. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Comm. May, supported by Comm. Borys, to adjourn the meeting at 8:27p.m. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY 5-0.